



Checklist for Review/Reconsideration of Library Books and/or Instructional Resources

This checklist is to be used when a library book or instructional resource is formally challenged under policy EF (Legal) and EF (Local) or when a resource is being informally reviewed by Sherman ISD Staff Members.

Date: _____

Person Completing Form: _____

Type of Review:

- ☐ Informal Review
☐ Formal Review

Type of resource:

- ☐ Library Book
☐ Classroom library book
☐ Instructional resource

Title: _____

Author/Producer: _____

Complainant Input if Appropriate:

Use this section for the review of Library and Classroom Library Books

Students' First Amendment rights are implicated by the removal of books from the shelves of a school library. A district shall not remove materials from a library for the purpose of denying students access to ideas with which the district disagrees. A district may remove materials because they are pervasively vulgar or based solely upon the educational suitability of the books in question. Bd. of Educ. v. Pico, 457 U.S. 853 (1982)

a. Is the book pervasively vulgar?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

b. Is the book educationally suitable for the grade level where it has been placed?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

To determine educational suitability, the committee may want to consider the following questions:

1. Appropriateness

a. Does the resource meet a need for the user?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

b. Is the book appropriate for the age and grade levels serviced by the classroom and/or library?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

c. Are the illustrations appropriate for the subjects and age levels?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not applicable

d. What are the beneficial qualities of the material?

e. What do you feel might be the result of a student reading/viewing this resource?

2. Content

- a. Is the content of this material or resource well presented by providing adequate scope, range, depth, and continuity?

☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not applicable

- b. Does the material present information not otherwise available?

☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not applicable

- c. Does the book material give a dimension or direction that is new or different from others available for the subject?

☐ Yes
☐ No

- d. Does the resource contain any of the following:

☐ Explicit language
☐ Sexual references
☐ Negative racial references
☐ Drug/Alcohol
☐ Negative religious references
☐ Excessive violence
☐ Other _____

3. Review/Evaluations

- a. Does this title or resource appear in one or more reputable selection aids?

☐ Yes ☐ No

(If yes, please list titles of selection aids and if it was reviewed favorably or unfavorably.)

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

Additional comments:

☐ Book should remain in the library at the following campus levels:

☐ Elementary

☐ Middle

☐ High

☐ Not applicable

☐ Book should be removed from the library at all levels.

Additional comments:

Signatures of review committee:

Chairperson/Primary reviewer: _____

Date: _____

Use this section for the review of Instructional Resources

1. Purpose

a. What is the overall purpose of the material or resource?

b. Is the purpose accomplished?

☐ Yes

☐ No

2. Authenticity (for works of non-fiction only)

a. Is the author or presenter competent and qualified in the field?

☐ Yes

☐ No

☐ Not applicable

b. What is the reputation and significance of the author or publisher/producer in the field?

c. Is the material current?

☐ Yes

☐ No

d. Are information resources well documented either in the resource or in guides?

☐ Yes

☐ No

☐ Not applicable

e. Are translations and interpretations faithful to the original?

☐ Yes

☐ No

☐ Not applicable

3. Appropriateness

a. Does the resource promote the educational goals and objectives of the curriculum of district schools?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

b. Is the resource appropriate for the level of the instruction needed?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

c. Are the illustrations appropriate for the subjects and age levels?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not applicable

d. Is the book appropriate for the age and grade levels serviced by the classroom and/or library?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

e. What are the beneficial qualities of the material?

f. What do you feel might be the result of a student reading/viewing this resource?

4. Content

a. Is the content of this material or resource well presented by providing adequate scope, range, depth, and continuity?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

b. Does it present information not otherwise available?

- ☐ Yes
☐ No

c. Does it give a dimension or direction that is new or different from other resources available for the subject?

☐ Yes

☐ No

5. Review/Evaluations

a. Does this title or resource appear in one or more reputable selection aids?

☐ Yes

☐ No

(If yes, please list titles of selection aids and if it was reviewed favorably or unfavorably.)

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

☐ Favorably ☐ Unfavorably

Recommendations by Review Committee for treatment of questioned resource:

☐ Instructional material is appropriate to use across all settings.

☐ Instructional material should be relocated to one or more campuses, specifically:

☐ Elementary

☐ Middle

☐ High

☐ Instructional material is inappropriate and should be replaced.

Additional Comments:

Signatures of review committee:

Chairperson: _____ Date: _____